Seven steps:

Ways to reduce instructional costs and improve undergraduate and graduate education

Bill Coplin

Bill Coplin has been the director of and a professor in the Public Affairs Program of the Maxwell School of Syracuse University and its College of Arts and Sciences since 1976. He has published extensively in the fields of international relations, public policy, political risk analysis, social science education and citizenship, and he has won numerous teaching awards. Coplin earned his bachelor's degree in social science from Johns Hopkins University in 1960, and both his master's (1962) and doctorate (1964) in international relations from American University. His book, *Ten Things Employers Want You to Learn in College*, advises undergraduates on how to make sure their college education pays off. He is a frequent contributor to *USA Today* on high school and college education.

Executive summary

This essay presents the following seven practices that could provide undergraduate and graduate students with high-quality education more efficiently: 1. Outsource selected courses and programs. 2. Expand opportunities for experiential learning credit in traditional four-year programs. 3. Give credit for programs offered by student services. 4. Unbundle university education by providing more credential options than only the traditional bachelor's and master's degrees. 5. Adapt existing concurrent enrollment programs with high schools so that students can graduate in fewer than four years. 6. Use undergraduate teaching assistants for lower-division courses. 7. Adopt an apprenticeship model for all doctoral programs.

This essay briefly describes each proposed practice, providing concrete examples and examining other possibilities. Costs and questions of quality are also discussed for each proposal. The paper concludes with a brief discussion of the impact on faculty.

Introduction

This essay presents seven practices that could provide undergraduate and graduate students with high-quality education more efficiently. No attempt is made to estimate the overall financial impact of the suggestions made here, but, according to a 2003 Delaware study comparing college and university costs, "instructional expenditures are largely associated with personnel costs."

This paper suggests ways to raise faculty productivity. After the proposals are described, the paper discusses a concrete example and explores other possibilities as well as the effects on costs and quality. The suggestions are based on my more than 35 years' experience as a full-time faculty member and full professor at Syracuse University in the Maxwell School and the College of Arts and Sciences. The suggestions primarily apply to research universities but may also be relevant to small colleges.

A word about quality is in order. If carried out in a competent way, each of the proposals suggested in this paper will raise quality while saving money. In their book *Teaching the New Basic Skills: Principles for Educating Children to Thrive in a Changing Economy*, Richard Murnane and Frank Levy demonstrate how paying attention to customers and empowering workers to solve problems together increase efficiency and quality at the K-12 level. A similar approach can reduce costs while improving quality at the undergraduate and graduate levels. Like the changes Murnane and Levy suggest, the key to reform is the organization and attitudes of the workers—in this case, the university faculty. All of the suggestions described in this paper can happen only if faculty members, particularly those in the traditional liberal arts, approach reform with open minds and a dedication to meet the needs of their students in a cost-effective way.

The criteria for quality are the extent to which educational programs help students develop the following:

1. Skills to succeed in the workforce.
2. A willingness to work in various ways for the public good.
3. Commitment to lifelong learning for its own sake.

These three goals encompass what most people see as the purposes of higher education, even though people may disagree over precise definitions and their

relative priority. The strategies discussed in this paper are assumed to enhance students' capacity to meet these goals. The paper does not address the political feasibility of these suggestions, yet the political roadblocks are significant. Although few of the ideas are likely to be fully adopted, they may stimulate more incremental steps to slow the rise in college costs.

The seven suggestions are the following:

1. Outsource selected courses and programs.
2. Expand opportunities for experiential learning credit in traditional four-year programs.
3. Give credit for programs offered by student services.
4. Unbundle university education by providing more credential options than the traditional bachelor's and master's degrees.
5. Adapt existing concurrent enrollment programs with high schools so that students can graduate in fewer than four years.
6. Use undergraduate teaching assistants for lower-division courses.
7. Adopt an apprenticeship model for all doctoral programs.

After presenting these specific suggestions, the essay will discuss the underlying dynamics in the way faculty members perceive themselves and their role in educating students. Finally, the paper will discuss briefly ways in which attitudes about faculty roles need to change.

Suggestion 1: Outsource some academic courses and programs

Training firms that sell their services to businesses, government and nonprofit organizations are big business—not just in the private sector, but in the public and nonprofit sectors as well. Although some of the training is technical and highly specific, much of it is not. Colleges and universities could save money, offer more diverse education and increase quality by using some of these vendors.

Example

More than 92 years old, Dale Carnegie Training operates in 65 countries and has more than 7 million graduates. Each of its programs is carefully developed, continuously evaluated and updated and survives because of its commercial success. Relatively few universities give academic credit for its courses. The Carnegie introductory course, which involves 12 sessions of three hours each in addition to outside assignments, is designed to introduce Dale Carnegie's theories of human relations and to encourage participants to practice those principles each week. Students are required to give two brief speeches each week. I recently completed the course and saw a remarkable transformation in the 25 people who attended. Individuals who mumbled during their first speech won speaking awards by the end. Each semester one of my students completes an internship for the organization in Syracuse and in exchange receives a tuition waiver for the introduction course, which costs $1,400. The students are uniform in their praise.

Other possibilities

Professional certification in various computer applications, such as those provided by Microsoft, Sun, Cisco Systems and Oracle, are already available to part-time students in many universities. Other programs, such as the HIPAA Academy, which provides training in the Health Information Privacy and Accountability Act (HIPAA) and its Administrative and Simplification Act, might also be included. The American Council on Education (ACE) and the National Program on Noncollegiate Sponsored Instruction (National PONSI) list and evaluate formal education courses offered by business, industry, professional associations, labor unions and other noncollegiate organizations.

Many training companies offer services that customers in the business, governmental and nonprofit sectors value highly. Why not make these services available to full-time students at the undergraduate and master's levels? Once colleges and universities create a market for such services, more and more varied training and educational commercial vendors will emerge. Faculty may choose to leave the university and set up their own educational services that they sell to higher educational institutions.

Cost

Outside vendors can deliver courses at well below the cost of traditional faculty. An additional cost saving would result from the flexibility in adding new programs without sinking costs into personnel who could not be shifted. Economies of scale would operate just as they do for classes in which one professor and five teaching assistants (TAs) handle 500 or more students. Even if faculty were willing, training them via outside vendors such as Dale Carnegie would not reduce costs.

Outside vendors can deliver courses at well below the cost of traditional faculty.

Quality

The quality of these programs varies not only by the company providing them, but also by individual trainer. Still, we can assume that the quality of the courses will be at least equal to the quality of those offered by in-house faculty if only because most commercial training firms have systematic evaluation and revision procedures and are required to satisfy the people who hire them.

In addition to high quality of instruction, the courses would at least satisfy students' career needs more directly. With respect to the Dale Carnegie training, for example, employers complain bitterly about college graduates' lack of "people skills." Working well with others is crucial to citizenship and personal development, two important goals of college education, but traditional liberal arts courses in psychology rarely offer practice in human relations.

Given the applied, practical nature of courses offered by outside vendors, students are likely to be more interested and invested in them. This alone should also increase the quality of learning, according to researchers and practitioners who see student engagement as the most important variable in student learning. Moreover, the practical training provided by private companies could help students develop many of the skills—such as communications, computer applications and human relations—essential for success in college.

Suggestion 2: Expand opportunities for experiential learning credit in traditional four-year programs.

Traditional four-year programs gradually have been providing more credit for field work and other similar experiences, but not enough to realize the inherent potential for cost-saving and increased educational quality. Degree programs such as the co-op program at Northeastern University give credit through internship and service-learning courses for experienced-based learning. Few traditional four-year university programs have thoroughly integrated real-world experience into their programs, and almost none allows credit related to work experience.

Example

Empire State College of the New York State SUNY system provides a model that traditional four-year colleges could adapt to their needs. Empire State's program lists a series of ways in which prior college-level learning can be used for credit toward a degree that includes transfer credit, examinations, evaluations by ACE and National PONSI, and individualized expert evaluation (called Prior Learning Assessments [PLAs]).

Other possibilities

All continuing education programs in U.S. colleges use this approach. Programs that have very limited residence requirements have been designed for full-time employees. Weekend seminars or weeklong class meetings in the summer are often used to supplement distance learning and independent study.

Cost

Given the limited faculty contact time and the use of overload and part-time faculty to staff these programs, the costs are presumably much lower than for traditional four-year programs. For example, students at Empire State College can acquire up to 30 credits (with an average of eight) through the PLA procedure at a cost to them of $300. A small fee is paid to an assessor to evaluate the claim for credit. Although four-year programs need not be built entirely around this model, semester programs or even courses within a semester that rely on experiences from internship, field work or employment could be delivered at lower cost to the institution.

Quality

Alumni of my program in policy studies at Syracuse University laud the use of experiential credit and encourage use of even more. The quality of these experiential approaches will depend on the competence of the staff and faculty delivering them. The key is having clearly defined and responsibly applied standards—the same key required for quality traditional academic coursework.

Suggestion 3: Give credit for programs run by student services

This section suggests that many student affairs programs on most campuses are an untapped source of potentially credit-bearing experiences. Like the previous section, this section encourages the integration of experiential learning into degree programs. In this case, the experience comes from students' on-campus activities.

Example

At Syracuse, the staff of the Office of Residential Life (ORL) offers a one-credit course titled PAF 121: Leadership Practicum at no cost to the department offering the course. The professional staff had been running a course for years with weekly meetings and a 30-hour retreat complete with readings, community service and papers. Three years ago, the course was offered in my program. Two sections of the course are offered each semester, and about 100 students are served annually.

Other possibilities

The following programs could support credit-bearing courses:

- **Career services.** Staff members from career services now offer a one-credit course to freshmen or sophomores to help them plan their college experience. The goal of the course is to help students understand the skills employers seek and how to use the college years to develop those skills.
- **Student employment.** Students tend to view part-time employment on campus as nothing more than a way of making money. Many supervisors of student employees treat students as day laborers. If student employment were viewed as a program to develop professional competencies, attitudes on both sides would change. Students would take their jobs more seriously, and supervisors would realize that encouraging professional development would yield higher productivity and less aggravation. Course credit—including bi-weekly class meetings, readings and reflection on their work—could be offered.
- **Student activities.** Hundreds of student organizations, both Greek and non-Greek, operate on campus, and student activities offices often provide "training"—usually in the form of one-day conferences or half-day seminars. Organizing student leaders' training programs around a list of

professional competencies would better prepare students for professional careers. Providing course credit would improve the quality of the experiences at a very small additional cost.

- **Residence hall programs.** The example provided above is only one way to generate credit for students using the training staff. Additional programs can be developed using the National Association of College and University Resident Halls (NACURH) to help set guidelines.
- **Athletic programs.** All intercollegiate and intramural athletic programs on campus provide a great opportunity for students to learn the skills that employers want. High on that list are work ethic, physical skills, working with and influencing people, using statistics and solving problems. Courses could be developed around these activities. For example, an applied statistics course in which students in athletic programs analyze the data on their own individual and team performance could be offered. A management course that required the students to apply management theories to the efforts of the coaching staff could be another option.
- **Community service support.** The full potential of the growth of community service, both volunteer and credit-based, over the past decade has yet to be realized in academic programs. Service learning has been touted as a way to drive home the theoretical perspectives of the classroom as well as to develop the citizenship dimensions of students' learning. Credit based on community service could be generated for almost every lower-division course.

Costs

These possibilities would require only design and monitoring activity by faculty as well as some additional funding for staff. Instruction costs already would be included in the budget if existing staff offered the course. If more staff were needed, they could be hired more cheaply than faculty would be.

Quality

Offering credit for student services programs would foster the three goals: career, citizenship and lifelong learning. Enriching the student activities to make them worthy of academic credit and providing powerful experiential education would translate into high-quality instruction to students in the areas they need it most. It would help students engage with their college education and lead to better academic performance. Much would depend on the competence, commitment and integrity of those designing and delivering the instruction. Also, tight administrative oversight would be needed to ensure that credit has the necessary academic content. However, these requirements do not differ from those that should be applied to any university course.

Offering credit for student services programs would foster the three goals: career, citizenship and lifelong learning.

Suggestion 4: Unbundle university education by providing more credential options to the traditional bachelor's and master's degrees

Although college students may need four years to mature and develop, many of them—especially nontraditional students—need more tailored programs. Creating programs that require fewer than 120 hours could save money.

Example

Many institutions of higher education offer programs in legal assistance. These programs, typically offered through continuing education departments, range from 15 to 26 credits and usually end with receipt of

a certificate rather than a formal degree. Dean Bea Gonzalez of Syracuse University says that continuing education students take a career ladder approach. She calls it "chunking the degree"—allowing students to stop at given stages and still feel satisfied. Eventually, they can attain a bachelor's degree in professional studies, but they can stop at the associate's level or after having attained certificates in a given field if they choose.

Other possibilities

A wide range of certificate options are offered through mid-career and continuing education programs. Traditional degree programs do not offer these useful courses of study, and students pursuing traditional degrees are often blocked if they try to get into these unconventional programs. To illustrate the wasteful cost of ignoring certificates in favor of degrees, consider the development of homeland security programs at various universities. In its August 25, 2004, issue, *USA Today* describes several initiatives, including one at Ohio State University, where "students can get a degree in political science, sociology or computer science with a concentration in homeland security." The program director stated: "In most cases, there is not yet a sufficiently well-developed body of knowledge that would declare [homeland security] to be a legitimate academic specialty." Consequently, students interested specifically in homeland security are required to learn Hobbes and Locke, material not directly pertinent to their future careers.

Cost

Students could save significant amounts of money if universities did not require 120 credit hours at the undergraduate level or offered more focused, tailored programs at the graduate level. Evidence for this can be found in the fact that tuition in continuing education programs is usually lower than in traditional programs. In this case, the market produces more for less. Higher education institutions would be financially challenged if a significant number of their students took advantage of unbundled programming. Students would be paying for less and getting more; the institutions would adapt or be transformed.

Quality

The traditional four-year degree has lost its academic focus at most colleges and universities. The proliferation of programs has provided more choices, but as Barry Schwartz pointed out in his January 23, 2004, *Chronicle Review* article, "The Tyranny of Choice," "this freedom comes at a price." Schwartz worries about the psychological price of the system, but the educational price is this essay's concern. A program of 120 hours cannot be coherent, given the fragmented and overspecialized nature of higher education. Such a program is burdened by marginally relevant requirements—courses that students neither want nor need, despite protestations by some faculty members that the 120-hour, broad-based approach is important in developing students' critical-thinking skills.

> The traditional four-year degree has lost its academic focus at most colleges and universities.

Lack of coherence is not just a problem for liberal arts students; it also affects those in professional schools. The general education or liberal arts requirements usually constitute the bulk of "non-major" coursework for an undergraduate in a professional school. Unbundling would reduce or eliminate much of that coursework, especially since professional school faculty members frequently find some of the liberal arts courses too diffuse. Liberal arts faculty members also question the narrow content and the quality of professional school curriculum. One also wonders if the numerous specialized requirements of professional school programs, especially those heavily shaped by accrediting bodies, are really necessary.

Suggestion 5: Adapt concurrent enrollment programs so more students can graduate in fewer than four years

Over the past 20 years, a growing number of programs allow students to earn college credit during high school. In 2001, the Education Commission of the States reviewed the various options, dividing the list into dual/concurrent enrollment and other college credit programs such as Advanced Placement, the International Baccalaureate and College Level Examination Program. The commission also listed states' policies toward these programs. According to the most recent figures from the National Association of Concurrent Enrollment Programs (NACEP), about 100 concurrent enrollment partnerships exist in 28 states. Together, these partnerships serve more than 150,000 students in more that 3,000 schools each year. With these programs growing, it is time for universities to take steps to develop fair and comprehensive acceptance programs so that students can complete their college degrees more quickly.

Example

Although many institutions give college credit for coursework taken during high school, few universities work proactively to help students graduate earlier by this means. At Syracuse University, students do not always file their requests for credit before arriving and do not always get a definitive answer from the university in time to plan first-semester courses. Students face serious roadblocks to having credits earned in high school accepted toward college graduation requirements. This tendency to grudgingly give college credit toward degree completion appears to be the norm throughout higher education.

Other possibilities

The problem here is not the lack of other possibilities; rather, it is higher education's lack of coordination and focus that prevents students from reducing substantially the number of credit hours they need. Before they make a commitment to matriculate, students should be able to negotiate which credits will be accepted and which requirements they will need to earn. Negotiating this arrangement up front will allow for better planning and possibly necessitate a shorter stay at the university.

Cost

The charges for these advance-credit courses are usually lower than for college tuition. Colleges could create these programs with little or no additional staff costs. In a November 17, 2004, edition of *Education Week*, Virginia Gov. Mark R. Warner said that his state has "vastly expanded the opportunities for students to earn college credits while still in high school." He notes that an agreement with 62 public and private institutions in Virginia ensures a coherent program and reduces a student's tuition burden by as much as $5,000.

Quality

Faculty members are likely to raise questions about the quality of coursework offered outside their institutions. The concern is legitimate; quality *should* be the concern for all classes, including those offered on their own campuses. NACEP currently is developing quality-control standards that will help allay this concern.

Well-run dual-enrollment programs offer college-level work that goes beyond the standardized testing and limited faculty-training model of Advanced Placement courses. For example, Syracuse University's Project Advance Program is a partnership program that links Syracuse University with secondary schools. Qualified seniors earn Syracuse University credit by attending regular lower-division courses held in their high schools. The courses are taught by local high school teachers who hold adjunct instructor appointments with SU. Project Advance provides in-service training and professional development for high school instructors,

a continuing forum for communication between educators from both the high school and university settings, and extensive ongoing research and evaluation for systematic improvement of instruction. University faculty and Project Advance administrators work directly with high schools to ensure that the SU courses taught in the high schools maintain standards identical to those of sections taught on the SU campus. SU recognizes these courses as regular offerings, and Project Advance students earn SU credit, verified by an official university transcript. The same evaluation instruments are used in the courses, and high school students generally perform as well as students on campus.

A clear and fair approach to recognizing credits earned in high school would enhance the quality of undergraduate education. Incoming freshmen with a large number of credits could enter directly into high-level courses, thus increasing their engagement and allowing them more options. They could also explore career interests and develop career-relevant skills sooner, leaving them more time to develop their capacities for civic engagement and lifelong learning.

Suggestion 6: Expand the use of undergraduate teaching assistants

Many institutions use undergraduate teaching assistants (UTAs) in a variety of capacities. In the mid-1990s at Syracuse University, 38 professors in 58 courses used UTAs. Professors employed these assistants in varying ways, compensating them monetarily or with credit. The systematic use of UTAs would both increase the quality of undergraduate offerings and reduce the money spent on large numbers of graduate students now needed to cover large lower-division courses.

Example

I have been working with UTAs since 1972, first in an introductory international relations course for the political science department and after 1976 in PAF 101: Introduction to the Analysis of Public Policy. Approximately 17 students from each class are selected to assist with a class of 125 students the following semester. The UTAs sign up for a three-credit course and meet three additional hours a week outside the course. The meetings are used for administrative details, to provide training on grading papers and to discuss how to improve the course. UTAs receive a 30-page course manual.

The UTAs perform the following tasks:

- Take attendance without using class time. (Students are placed in groups of about 10, all of whom sit together with their UTA during class.)
- Grade about eight sets of five papers required for the course. (Each paper is double-graded, and students can request a regrade directly from the professor at no risk of a lower grade. About 10 percent request a regrade. UTAs receive extensive training from the professor on how to grade papers.)
- Run workshops during six classes throughout the semester. (These are not discussion sections such as those normally led by graduate students. Rather, they involve highly structured group activities. Small class exercises can be conducted in the lecture because the UTAs can coordinate the group.)
- Conduct surveys on specific parts of the class throughout the semester. (A UTA conducts a survey on each outside speaker who addresses the class.)
- Maintain a Web site and produce a biweekly newsletter for students enrolled in the course.
- Nominate, recruit and assist in the selection of the following semester's UTAs.
- Organize and administer the five-hour community service requirement.

- Write staff reports suggesting changes. (These changes are often implemented the following semester.)
- Suggest new ideas for changing classroom presentations, bringing in speakers, altering assignments and adding supplementary experiences (i.e., outside lectures).
- Keep one office hour a week. (This stipulation means that there are 17 UTA office hours available to students in the class in addition to the professor's six office hours.)
- Provide tutoring and suggest resources for student papers. (Many UTAs have specialized knowledge in a specific policy area far beyond that of the professor.)

Other possibilities

Every introductory course could use undergraduate teaching assistants, as could some upper-division courses.

Every introductory course could use undergraduate teaching assistants.

Cost

Fewer graduate students would be needed for the traditional work of taking attendance, grading papers, tutoring, conducting exercises or managing community service. Graduate students could be more involved in course design, managing the undergraduates, course evaluation and special enrichment activities; as a result, colleges and students could be getting more of their money's worth. A credit-bearing course for the UTAs offered by the professor who teaches the course could ensure quality performance and enhance UTAs' learning. It would also generate more credits at little additional cost.

The main cost saving would result from reducing the need for teaching assistantships. Fewer graduate students would mean more highly qualified graduate students. Highly qualified graduate students would increase the output and efficiency of doctoral programs. With more graduate students available for research projects, faculty members would be better able to obtain grants and conduct and publish research.

Quality

The aforementioned examples clearly demonstrate that everyone benefits from the use of UTAs. Undergraduates learn more because the instructor can assign written papers instead of multiple-choice examinations for a large class. UTAs are available many hours a week for personal tutorials, at which attendance is required. The course material is evaluated continuously to ensure its clarity to the students. UTAs learn even more. Graduate students take on a more professional role in the development, delivery, design and evaluation of courses. The use of UTAs would also allow departments to be more selective in admitting only the most highly qualified doctoral candidates. As faculty found undergraduates to be junior professionals, they would build relationships that will increase undergraduate engagement and support their research activities. The threats to quality are the same threats to the quality of any course: The commitment, competence and integrity of the faculty members running the course are the determining factors.

Suggestion 7: Adopt an apprenticeship model for all doctoral programs

Doctoral programs are expensive and require substantial subsidies from outside funders and other areas of the university. This section suggests how existing Ph.D. programs can be streamlined by placing graduate students into apprenticeship roles after their first year and using an "up or out" system. A truly capable doctoral student should be relieved of survey

courses and should quickly start research that will lead to the dissertation and scholarly publications. Research seminars and independent studies can facilitate this work.

Example

I designed and offered an apprentice-based doctoral program in international relations and used the same approach with doctoral students in political science at Syracuse University in the early 1970s. The amount of formal coursework was reduced, and credits were offered for seminar and independent study courses designed to produce written products for grants or academic conferences. This highly focused approach ran counter to the trend of requiring basic courses to introduce graduate students to the many subfields of the disciplines. The apprenticeship approach also applied to teaching. Because UTAs were employed in the classroom, graduate students not only had time to focus on their research but also could help design the courses offered to undergraduates. Some taught their own courses, which made them attractive hires.

Other possibilities

I know of no graduate programs that use this approach, despite regular calls on all sides to streamline the process.

Cost

This practice will reduce the costs of doctoral programs by reducing the number of unqualified students entering graduate schools and speeding up their time to graduation. It will make faculty more efficient in both their teaching and research activities. If faculty treated their advanced graduate courses as research seminars on topics of interest to them, those courses could be considered part of their research rather than their teaching load. My faculty colleagues and I successfully did just that.

Quality

This apprenticeship approach yielded significant successes between 1970 and 1976. The program began with 10 students who had been in the pipeline for three years or more and with several who were just beginning their graduate work. Those already in the pipeline finished in 18 months. Many of the new students left after completing their master's degrees because they were either unwilling or unable to become apprentices to the faculty. Those who stayed finished in four years. Because they were not allowed to seek employment unless our faculty were convinced that they would finish their dissertation before their new job started, students were motivated to finish in a timely manner.

The apprentice approach is based on the same pedagogical philosophy that supports most of the suggestions in the paper—learning by doing. The students who went through this process did extremely well after graduating. Two became presidents of the major academic organization in their field, and all who went into teaching earned tenure at their universities. Quality and common sense demand that institutions give doctoral students experience in their academic trade early in their graduate program and graduate them as quickly as possible. A new Ph.D. facing challenges as an assistant professor will learn much more about teaching and research in that role than he or she would by spending the extra time in graduate school.

What it will take

The seven suggestions together represent a multifaceted approach to reducing cost while increasing or at least maintaining the quality of education at four-year universities. Some of the suggestions could also apply to two-year colleges. All will require most faculty members to change the way they approach education, and that stipulation presents the biggest challenge. Professors need to see themselves as more than purveyors of information and techniques. For their best students, they should see themselves as professionals

offering apprenticeships. Their evaluations should become part of the mentoring process. For their wider body of students, universities need to expand beyond direct contact with students by capitalizing on outside vendors, developing experiential learning opportunities and using undergraduate teaching assistants.

The philosophy presented here is that faculty should help students reach their career, citizenship and lifelong learning goals. A list of objectives can be developed for each of these goals. I have compiled a list for the career component in a book, *Ten Things Employers Want You to Learn in College*. Similar lists can be compiled for citizenship and lifelong learning. Faculty members can use the list of learning outcomes to guide their design and management of the educational environment.

Each of the seven suggestions places faculty members in the role of managing the education of their students. By bringing outside vendors and using undergraduate teaching assistants, they are procuring appropriate resources for their students. In expanding the role of experiential learning on and off campus, faculty members are directing their activities and evaluating their performance. In unbundling their education and facilitating the use of concurrent enrollment programs, faculty members are helping students, as clients, satisfy their needs. In adopting an apprenticeship approach to doctoral education, they are taking a flexible and responsible role to help their students learn.

Bringing resources, managing the educational environment and evaluating performance are already identified roles for faculty members. However, most faculty members approach this in the traditional ways: lecturing, discussing and grading tests and assignments. They need to recognize that "teaching is not telling" and that they can provide better education more effectively and at lower cost by looking at their jobs differently. They also need to accept that the practices of continuing education offer much that could be adapted to their traditional academic programs. It would be dishonest to downplay the significant threats inherent in these suggestions—threats not only to the academy's status quo, but also to faculty jobs. Some of these practices, particularly outsourcing and unbundling, would lead to fewer faculty positions and teaching assistantships. Change brings uncertainty and unexpected risks, but university faculty members need to accept the idea of change within their institutions at least as much as many of them call for change outside the academy.

Most important, faculty members need to accept the reality that costs need to be contained and quality needs to be increased.

Most important, faculty members need to accept the reality that costs need to be contained and quality needs to be increased. For each of these suggestions, those who find these practices troublesome are likely to raise the argument that quality will suffer and that students will be short-changed. I have tried to show how quality will actually be improved for each example, if only because students will be more engaged. Ultimately, the quality argument comes down to the degree to which those providing the education have the necessary commitment, competence *and* integrity. Examples of high- and low-quality offerings already abound—in both traditional and nontraditional programs. Some faculty members bristle at the idea that they are "workers" who have a responsibility to serve their clients even as they lobby for higher wages, more freedom and less work. Syracuse University Chancellor Nancy Cantor considers the university a "public good." Cutting costs will improve access for low-income students and offer improved quality of education for all students. If that is not for the public good, what is? ■